

Analyzing Authors' Claims

Read the debate on pages 22-23 about whether zoos are ethical, then follow the directions below to analyze each author's claims and decide who makes a stronger case.

AUTHOR: Dennis Kelly
Director, Smithsonian's National Zoo

AUTHOR: Marta Holmberg
People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals (PETA)

Author's main claim or argument in the debate:

Author's main claim or argument in the debate:

REASON 1: Name one reason the author gives for his claim.

REASON 1: Name one reason the author gives for her claim.

List evidence the author gives to support Reason 1.

List evidence the author gives to support Reason 1.

REASON 2: Name another reason the author presents.

REASON 2: Name another reason the author presents.

List evidence the author gives to support Reason 2.

List evidence the author gives to support Reason 2.

REASON 3: Name a third reason the author presents.

REASON 3: Name a third reason the author presents.

List evidence the author gives to support Reason 3.

List evidence the author gives to support Reason 3.

What persuasive devices does the author use?

- Appeals to emotions
- Uses data or scholarly research
- Tells why the other side's argument is weak
- Other: _____

What persuasive devices does the author use?

- Appeals to emotions
- Uses data or scholarly research
- Tells why the other side's argument is weak
- Other: _____

EVALUATE: Which author do you think makes a more effective case? Do you spot any weaknesses—like a bias or missing information—in either argument? Explain on a separate sheet of paper.

Uses: copy machine, opaque projector, or transparency master for overhead projector. Scholastic Inc. grants teacher-subscribers to The New York Times Upfront permission to reproduce this Skills Sheet for use in their classrooms. ©2016 by Scholastic Inc. All rights reserved.